



Islamic Republic of Afghanistan  
Ministry of Education  
Planning and Evaluation Department  
Research and Evaluation Unit

## **Education Joint Sector Review**

**2015**

# **Summary Report**

**4<sup>th</sup> May 2016**



## **Contents**

<b>Introduction.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Methodology and Review Processes .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Chapter I: General Education Findings and Recommendations .....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Chapter II: Teacher Education Findings and Recommendations .....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>Chapter III: Curriculum Development Findings and Recommendation .....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>Chapter IV: Islamic Education Findings and Recommendation .....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>Chapter V: TVET Findings and Recommendation.....</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>Chapter VI: Literacy Findings and Recommendation.....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>Final Remarks (way forward).....</b>	<b>17</b>

## Introduction

Education is the right for every Afghan child, as stated in the Afghanistan Constitution 1382 and Education Law 1386. Therefore, Ministry of Education (MoE) is responsible to provide quality education for all school-age children in every corner of the country.

During the past years, Ministry of Education has implemented many education programs with support from the government and the development partners.

In order to know the achievements and the challenges facing such programs, MoE annually conducts Education Joint Sector Review. Annual review of the education is a process in which the MoE reviews the progress and achievements against the set goals and objectives of the strategic and operational plans, and shares the findings with the stakeholders.

In 2015 the review was designed and implemented with the support from UNESCO Kabul and IIEP-Paris. Field visits to 12 provinces have been conducted and as result provincial review reports were prepared in Dari language and national review report for each of MoE program were drafted and finalized in Dari and translated into English.

## Methodology and Review Processes

The goal is to review progress made by MoE in 2015, identify the current challenges in designing and implementing plans, carrying out monitoring and evaluation, allocation of budget, finance, and procurement processes at national and sub-national levels to achieve the desired objectives specified in the strategic and operational plans. The review has covered all the MoE priority programs as a result six national review reports were prepared focusing on relevance, access, equity, quality and management, that are as follows:

1. *General Education (79 pages)*
2. *Curriculum Development (23 pages)*
3. *Teacher Education (43 pages)*
4. *Islamic Education (22 pages)*
5. *Technical and Vocational Education and Training (70 pages)*
6. *Literacy Education (22 pages)*

Mixed method (qualitative and quantitative) used for data collection and analysis. Tables and formats, closed and open-ended questionnaires, exploratory questionnaires, follow-up questionnaires and interview guides were used to collect the data. Participatory approach has been adopted in the entire review process including field visits and report writing.

In total 12 provinces (Kandahar, Farah, Ghazni, Laghman, Nangrahar, Bamyan, Panjsher, Kapisa, Parwan, Balkh, Kabul province and Kabul city), which 36 districts 211 education centers were selected and visited by the review team.

## Chapter I: General Education Findings and Recommendations

This chapter presents summary of the findings (progress and challenge) and recommendations of sub-sector review report of General Education for the year 2015.

### **Section I: General Education Performance against 1395/2015 Operational Plan**

On average General Education has achieved 82% of its annual targets for the year 2015/1394. Student enrollment had increased only 1% compared to the previous year.

There has not been any target for recruitment of teachers, since Ministry of Finance has not allocated any new teaching positions for MoE. However, some teachers have been recruited, since in most of the provinces there are quite a large number of vacant teaching positions. School establishment and upgrading pace has slowed down, since it required deployment of additional teaching and administrative positions.

Textbooks have been distributed for primary, but not for lower and upper secondary levels. Review Team found students without full set of textbooks in the classes during field visits.

Table (1): GE Summary of operational plan achievement

No	Activities	2014	2015 Target	2015 Achievement	% of Progress
1	Student Enrolment	8,583,706	8,920,578	<b>8,666,297</b>	97%
2	Number of Teacher	184,642	184,642	<b>184,024</b>	100%
3	Number of School	15,081	15,081	<b>15,249</b>	101%
4	No. Establishment		1,435	<b>411</b>	29%
6	Textbooks Distribution	21,341,862	42,929,492	<b>35,079,939<sup>1</sup></b>	82%

Most of the operational plan activities are from ordinary budget; therefore, the performance shows higher level of achievement, while in the development budget the execution rate is very low as of 20% for GE in 1394. Plan activities and budget lines did not have any strong link and it is not result based; therefore, it was almost impossible to track the level of progress and budget expenditure together. In addition, data quality assurance and verification is still a challenge to report properly and conduct quality analysis.

***Recommendation #1: Operational Plan and Annual Budget documents need to be integrated and send to all program units and provinces for better implementation of activities. The plan should have both ordinary and development budget activities. Therefore the current typical operational plan format may require adjustment accordingly.***

---

<sup>1</sup> The Review Team has noticed this has not been 35 million it has been 22 million.

## **Section II: General Education Review Findings and Recommendations**

**A: Relevance of General Education:** the main focus on relevance has been to understand to what extent the General Education program responds to children's needs.

Despite lots of efforts made by MoE and its development partners to provide pre-school education still its relevance requires more attention in terms of target groups, determination of enrollment age, describing delivery modality, introduction of curriculum and textbooks, training and recruitment of teachers.

To measure the relevance of Basic and Secondary Education two indicators have been used: 1) enrolment of 12<sup>th</sup> grade graduates in higher/ semi higher education institutes. 2) Direction of GE grade 9<sup>th</sup> graduates to Technical and Vocational Education.

There were around 359,000 students (34% girls) in grade 10<sup>th</sup> in GE school in 2015, whereas around 257,000 students (35% girls) graduated from grade 12<sup>th</sup> in 2015.

According to MoE and MoHE in total 27% of graduates of 12<sup>th</sup> grade of GE schools in 2015 managed at the same year to get into higher education while 73% which is a great percentage could not. However, in total 2.8% of students in grade 10<sup>th</sup> joined the TVET schools in 2015 the rest continued with the General Education.

There were no any data available for the review team to indicate the number of Kankor failed students and 12<sup>th</sup> grade graduates who managed to get employment in the job market. However, it seems there are many obstacles in place for grade 12<sup>th</sup> graduates to join the labor market as well. There is less employment opportunities available in the public sector and according to Civil Service Commission Law, a 12<sup>th</sup> grade graduate has limited opportunity to join the government agencies.

The other option for grade 12<sup>th</sup> graduates is get employment in private sector. The basic concern is that whether these graduates have acquired any skills rather than knowledge to work in private sectors. Obviously no vocational subjects are included in the curriculum of GE. In addition to that, "job creation" could be one of the goals that the education system of the country strives to prepare students for.

***Recommendation #2:*** *In order to make General Education more relevant, grade 9<sup>th</sup> should be considered as completion of Basic Education and the graduates need to be recognized and provide with certificate. Moreover, in grades 10, 11 and 12 soft vocational subjects need to be added in the curriculum as well as current subjects need to be made more relevant to the higher education departments and Kankor Exam.*

**B: Access to General Education:** In 2015, around 37,454 children (56% girls) are enrolled in pre-school classes run by MoE and development partners. The estimate shows it is only 1% to 3% of that age group. The number of General Education students increased from 8,583,706 in 2014 to 8,667,321 (39% girls) in 2015. However, the estimate shows there

are around 12 million school age children in the country. Although MoE does not know the exact number and location of out of school children, the rough estimate shows more than 3 million children are out of school and a large number of students are permanently absent.

In general 70% of General Education students are enrolled in primary, 19% in lower secondary and 11% in upper secondary. The number of primary level students is 3.6 times more than lower secondary and 6.4 times more than upper secondary education. Therefore, due to lack of supply side intervention and facilities and demand side barriers, population that has official age of secondary level schooling has limited access to education.

***Recommendation #3:*** MoE should conduct a comprehensive school mapping exercise including mapping the drop-outs and out of school children and besides should study the barriers to their education to introduce new strategy and intervention to educate them.

**C: Equity in General Education:** Gender Parity Index in enrollment is 0.63 at the national level, and this shows low participation of girls in general education. The percentage of female student is 40, 36, and 34 in primary, lower-secondary and upper-secondary, respectively. The GPI in provinces of Dikondi, Panjshir, Sari-pul, Noristan, Nimroze, Herat, Faryab, Balkh, Badakhshan and Kabul is above the national average, ranging from 0.64 to 0.88, and unlike in Urzgan, Khost, Paktika, , Zabul, Kandahar, Helmand, Badghis, and Paktia GPI is less than the national average, ranging from 0.17 to 0.62.

Only 23% of the total schools are in the urban areas while 77% of schools are in the rural areas. But out of students enrolment 60% is in the rural area schools and 40% in the urban area schools. Schools in the rural areas are less crowded and enrolment is low as well.

At the national level, only 33% of teachers and 39% of students are females. There are nine provinces that have less than 10% of female teachers. Kabul city has 74% female teachers and Paktika 1%. In the provinces where percentage of female teacher is low relatively the enrolment of female students is also low, particularly in the secondary level.

Kabul city with 98% of schools with buildings have the highest number of schools with permanent building and also Jawzjan, Balkh, Bamyān, Kabul province, Panjshir, and Kandahar provinces have the high number of schools with building ranking next, while Ghor province with 22% has the lowest number of schools with building. However, the review could not analyze to what extent schooling buildings are standardized and usable.

***Recommendation #4:*** Girls' education requires special attention and rapid increase is needed in the number of female teachers especially in the specific provinces that the number of female teachers is very less. MoE with support from donors and stakeholders should develop a 5-year school construction plan and give the priority to those provinces that have fewer shares of school buildings.

**C: Quality of General Education:** MoE has taken several measures to enhance quality of education such as, increase in the number of professional teachers, revision and distribution of textbooks, strengthening the supervision and monitoring, conducting students' learning assessment in the early grades, increase in school buildings and utilizing equipment and information technology in education. In spite of these efforts, a great number of graduates of General Education still lack the required quality and competencies to join Higher Education institutes. Based on Kankor Exam data 42.5 percent of the applicants have scored less than 50% of total mark in Kankor.

Students' promotion on national level from primary level to secondary level is 87% and this figure is 97% for boys and 87% for girls. The promotion rate from lower secondary to upper secondary is 82%. Student decline dramatically in higher grades particularly girls.

According to the EMIS, 51% of the teachers are not academically qualified. 10% of the teachers have Bachelors or above, 38% are graduates of 14<sup>th</sup> grade of TTCs, 43% are 12<sup>th</sup> grade graduates and 9% are lower than 12<sup>th</sup> grade.

The PTR in 1394/2015 at the national level was 47:1 that drastically diverts from the MoE norms. If the number of students is higher than the MoE norm, it would be difficult for teachers to achieve the educational goal in a 45-minute session. Only 23% of the provinces have on average a PTR that meets the norms of the MoE, about 49% of the provinces have a PTR close to the norms or have acceptable situation. However, 28% of the provinces have PTR of 50 to 92 that are not acceptable as far as quality is concerned.

***Recommendation #5:*** *The quality of education need to be defined and quality learning standards need to be developed and applied in all educational settings. MoE need to develop a comprehensive learning assessment system which will include formative and summative assessments as well as national standard examination. The content and layout of the textbooks has very much improved but still needs to be upgraded to the standards of competency based curriculum.*

*School facility such as building, library and laboratory adds into the quality, therefore, attention is needed to provide science kits and other necessary equipment.*

*In-service teacher training need to be expanded and train teachers based on the school needs.*

## Chapter II: Teacher Education Findings and Recommendations

This chapter provides a succinct summary of progress, challenges and recommendations of sub-sector review report of Teacher Education Program for the year 2015.

### **1. Teacher Education Program Performance against Annual Operational Plan:**

Teacher Education Program achieved 98% of its targets in the year 2015. The Operational Plan for 2015 in Teacher Education Program did not have Short-term trainings in INSETs and no Teacher Education College or Teacher Development Center was built either. The summary of the important points along with their percentage of progress has been given there-under:

Table (2): TE Summary of the Operational Plan for the Year 2015

No	Activities	2014	2015 Target	2015 Achievement	% of Progress
1	Students' Enrolment in Teacher Education	81,212	85,570	81,907	96%
2	Number of TTCs	48	48	48	100%
3	Number of District Support Centers	199	199	199	100%
4	Number of TTC Instructors	2,302	2,528	2,549	101%

As mentioned earlier that Teacher Education has managed to spend most of its budget and the progress can be observed in the schematic view. It merits mentioning that Teacher Education Program has not built any new TTC/ TDC for the last several years despite the gigantic demand in most of the districts of the country. Teacher Education and Curriculum Development managed to spend AFN 1,003 Billion out of 1,038 Billion from their Recurrent Budget with Execution rate 97% in 2015 and TE and CD also managed to spend AFN 1,757 Billion out of AFN 4,023 Billions with Execution rate 44% in 2015.

***Recommendation #6:*** Close liaison is required among the central and provincial plan officials regarding the targets, progress, achievements and challenges of the operational plans to align the targets and know the progress and challenges on timely manner.

### **2. Review Findings and Recommendations:**

**A. Relevance of Teacher Education:** Fields of study in TE program are made in line with the needs of schools to be responsive to the needs of schools in relevant subjects. TE program has been prepared in a way to facilitate teachers with good education and training to be able to teach at schools professionally and well. Efforts are made to have only those fields of study at TE programs to be productive for both TE students and students of schools and both get more advantage out of it.

**Recommendation #7:** *All of the fields of study should be aligned with the needs of General Education and Islamic Education schools and the subjects that have posed more challenges for schools should be made as core fields of study at TTCs/ TDCs since most of the General Education schools ought to have qualified science subject teachers.*

**B. Access to Teacher Education:** According to the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Afghanistan and Educational Law of our country, getting education is right of every individual of Afghanistan and to have access to quality education in the country. It is essential for prospective students of TE to have access to TE programs at nearby distance to be able to get the required skills and knowledge and play their role in educating the children of Afghanistan.

**Recommendation #8:** *TE service should be made accessible throughout the country for its prospective students and more TTCs and TDCs are needed across the country particularly at district level since most of the districts of the country do not have TTCs and TDCs and prospective students particularly girls cannot access TTCs and TDCs.*

**C. Quality of Teacher Education:** Quality of TE program is dependent upon quality education at TTCs and TDCs via qualified and experienced teachers who are able to train good teachers for GE and IE schools. The curriculum of TE program, labs, libraries, well-equipped Computer labs and TTCs and TDCs atmosphere are directly linked with the quality of Teacher Education.

**Recommendation #9:** *To improve the quality of TE programs it is essential to recruit professional and qualified teachers to teach at TTCs and TDCs. The teachers must have sound knowledge of the subject and methodology. We should invest over students to improve the quality and to improve quality, it is needed to invest more over TTCs and TDCs and equip them with necessary equipment such as libraries, labs, computers and other items.*

**D. Equity:** Equity in TE means the Gender parity in enrollment of students in TE program, having female teachers for female students, geographical equity among provinces and districts, equity in distribution of budget among pre-service and in-service programs.

**Recommendation #10:** *Equity should be maintained in the award of Teacher Education services across the country since most of the girls in the far-flung areas of the country are deprived of TE programs due to non-adherence to the equity aspect of the TE Program.*

## Chapter III: Curriculum Development Findings and Recommendation

This chapter offers a summary of main findings and recommendations of sub-sector review report on GE Curriculum Development for the year 2015.

### **1. Educational Curriculum Development against Annual Operational Plan**

Most of the targets of Educational Curriculum Development have not been achieved and even if achieved the percentage is quite low and cannot be accounted for. It is stated that most of the targets have not been achieved owing to lack of budget and non-availability of funds with General Directorate of Educational Curriculum Development and General Directorate of Publication and Information.

Table (3): CD Summary of the Operational Plan for the year 2015

No	Activities	2015 Target	2015 Achievement	% of Progress
1	Textbooks development on 3 <sup>rd</sup> languages	92	72	78%
2	Proper evaluation of curriculum implementation at schools	2	2	100%

The General Directorate of Publication and Information stated that owing to lack of sufficient budget, they were unable to publish textbooks in line with the number targeted in their operational plan at the beginning of the year.

**Access:** MoE supervises the process of publication and distribution of textbooks to ensure timely access of all students to textbooks. To fulfill this goal a proper plan for publication and distribution of textbooks is prepared based on the figures and findings to develop publication and distribution of textbooks and evaluate the results.

**Recommendation #11:** Complete sets of textbooks should be made available for all students of GE and IE as non-availability of textbooks has posed serious problems for students across the country. Moreover, teachers should also have access to teachers' guides since most of the teachers are faced with many problems due to non-availability of the teachers' guides.

**B. Quality:** The program of curriculum development measures and evaluates the ratio of usage and efficiency of textbooks usage inside classrooms and utilizes these findings for the betterment of curriculum. This program assigns authors to teach their authored books at schools to know the deficiencies and drawbacks in their books and tackle them accordingly. This program also invites qualified and experienced teachers from provinces to participate in the correction and authorship of textbooks in the centers.

**Recommendation #12:** Textbooks for General Education should be developed by qualified and professional authors in line with national values and international standards.

## Chapter IV: Islamic Education Findings and Recommendation

This chapter of the report summarizes the findings (progress and challenges) and recommendations of sub-sector review report on Islamic Education for year 2015.

### **1. Islamic Education Program Performance against Annual Operational Plan:**

Most of the targets of the Islamic Education have been achieved; the progress in terms of number of training centers was 79% whereas the number of students and teachers has increased more than the targets annual plan.

Table (4): IE Summary of the Operational Plan for the year 2015

No	Activities	2014	2015 Target	2015 Achievement	% of Progress
1	Number of Students	299,693	300,000	312,093	104
2	Number of Teachers	9,595	7,381	8,952	121
3	Number of Training centers	865	1,144	906	79
	Spent Budget	100% of recurrent and 20% of development budgets were spent			

### **2. Review of Findings and Recommendations:**

Findings and recommendations are categorized in term of relevance, access, quality, equity and management.

**A: Relevance of Islamic Education:** The purpose of this program is to produce religious knowledge and prepare the graduates to take religious roles and positions. In Afghanistan context it means facilitating moderate interpretation of the Islamic teaching and educating students for playing religious roles, as mullah (religious scholar), Imam (religious cleric) and teacher. The curriculum of Islamic education is not compatible with the above purpose; instead of critical thinking, memorization or rote learning of contents is emphasized.

**Recommendation #13:** *Islamic education curriculum needs to be revised and updated; modern issues would be included in curriculum and comparative approach and critical thinking would be encouraged in the process of training.*

**B: Access to Islamic Education:** Access to Islamic education means that all who are interested should have access to Islamic education; whether these people live in the rural areas or in the urban areas. The big challenge in terms of access to Islamic education is the huge distance among Islamic schools. The number of Islamic schools is limited and not as many as the general education schools, which are in many villages and districts.

**Recommendation #14:** *Expansion of access to Islamic education depends on the number of Islamic schools accessible to all applicants. Currently, most of applicants have no access to Islamic schools. Therefore, review recommends that MoE can use mosques as training center and mullahs (religious cleric) as teacher in remote areas, where there is no Islamic Schools.*

**C: Equity in Islamic Education:** If the equity in Islamic education is reviewed from the gender and geographical perspectives, Islamic education is faced with serious challenges in both areas. Gender imbalance in access to Islamic education is a serious challenge in the country. The number of female students in Islamic education is about 20% of the total students in Islamic education. From the geographical perspective, the disparity is between centers and marginalized areas; this means that most of Islamic schools and institutions such as Madrassa (Seminary), Darulhufaz (Quran memorizing center) and Darululum (Higher Seminary) are located in the cities and in the centers of districts. Therefore, the people who live in marginalized areas do not have access to these Islamic centers.

**Recommendation #15:** *Therefore, review recommends that improving gender equity in Islamic education, needs establishing more female schools and recruiting more female teachers. Establishing more Islamic schools in remote areas and constructive interaction with mosques and mullahs can solve the problem of geographical inequity in access to Islamic education.*

**D: Quality of Islamic Education:** The existing curriculum besides all its privileges in terms of content and methods has some challenges. In term of the content, the books do not have the updated concepts. In Islamic education curriculum, modern issues including violence, environmental crises were not addressed. Regarding to the methodology, the problem is that in the Islamic education curriculum, critical thinking and "IJTIHAD" is not addressed enough.

**Recommendation #16:** *Therefore, review the curriculum would be revised and updated based on modern standard of curriculum. Revision of curriculum will improve the quality and increase the expected competency of the graduates.*

## Chapter V: TVET Findings and Recommendation

In this chapter, summary of progress, challenges and recommendations of sub-sector review report of TVET for year 2015 is presented.

### **Section I: TVET performances against operational plan**

On average TVET program achieved 54% of its targets for the year 2015/1394. The total budget of TVET program was 1,285,278,225 Afs in 2014. Fortunately the budget ceiling in enhanced in 2015. Thus in 2015, the total budget was 1,360,084,729 Afs which showed 74,806,504 Afs increase over the total budget than that of 2014.

Due to shortage of teachers TVET program recruited 394 more teachers most of them on the contract basis. Also, the trend for the number of TVET students has slightly declined in comparison with last year. Hence target for enrollment met only 61% of the target. Also 34 new TVET institutions were established in 2015.

Table (5): TVET Summary of operational plan achievement

No	Activities	1393/2014 Achievement	1394/2015 Target	1394/2015 Achievement	% of Progress	Growth
1	Student Enrolment	80,830	129,286	78,900	61%	-2%
2	Number of Instructors	2,375	5,058	2,769	55%	17%
3	Number of School and Institute	260	292	294	101%	13%
4	Textbooks Distribution	80,100	600,000	2,799	0.50%	3%

In 2015 out of 1.360 billion (Afs) recurrent budget, 98% (1.327 billion Afs) executed while in the development budget out of 2.245 billion (Afs) 32% (723 billion Afs) spent in 2015. In fact, the performance shows higher level of budget execution rate in recurrent budget while in the development budget the execution rate is very low due to different causes such as long procurement process, financial bureaucratic paperwork, insecurity, climate change, donors' commitment and etc.

### **Section II: TVET Review findings and recommendations**

**A. Relevance of TVET:** In this part, the ratio and the relevance of TVET operational activities with the existing needs in the labor market have been studied.

Currently, more than 75 miscellaneous vocational trades are taught in the TVET institutions throughout Afghanistan. The proportion of vocational trades and subject based professional teachers has been imbalanced.

Students completing 14<sup>th</sup> grade of TVET institutes take a special entrance examination to enter higher education technical and vocational universities. In 2014 totally 15,454 students (2,740 female) graduated from TVET institutes. Only 15% of them who had received on average 80% score managed to attend university entrance examination. Out of the total participants, only 25% of them succeeded in the examination.

Currently the approach for entrance examination set up in such a way that MoHE prepares the exam questions in the way that 60% of questions are based on vocational trades and the remaining 40% of them are from general education subjects while TVET students do not study general subjects such as Geography, History and etc. As a result most of TVET students cannot succeed in the national customized examination in higher education.

**Recommendation #17:** *teachers with low educational qualification should be identified and a proper training plan should be designed. Also coordination needs to be set up with MoHE in order to set up a proper mechanism for examination system for TVET students.*

**B. Access to TVET:** On the basis of EMIS data, the total number of TVET students in 2013 was 61,004 (13.4% female) and this number had a 32% increase in 2014. Thus the total number of students reached 80,830 (16% female). in 2015 the number of students declined to some extent and reached to 78,900 (18.4% female). There are a lot of factors attached to girls' low contribution in TVET institutions particularly shortage of female teachers.

According to TVET, the recruitment process was good in 2015 and as a result 394 new teachers including 26 female were recruited. The total number of TVET teachers in 2015 reached 2769 (20.3% female). The recruitment rate of female teachers is quite low, while there is vigorous need for female teachers in almost all TVET institutions. One of the reasons is shortage of qualified and professional female candidates in almost all over Afghanistan.

According to the data from TVET, totally 294 TVET institutions including 171 schools and 123 institutes are functioning in Afghanistan. There are a number of challenges in terms of students' access to set of textbooks. Most of students do not have access to textbooks this is because TVET program was unable to print and distribute complete set of textbooks for students during one last decade.

**Recommendations #18:** *TVET institutions facing shortage of teachers should be identified and assessed. The GPI indicator should be considered at schools and the process for recruitment of new teachers based on subjects and vocational trades should be accelerated. To meet textbooks needs it is proposed that learning Tablets should be provided for students. The complete set of technical and vocational textbooks and other resourcing and supporting documents such as extra learning materials and videos should be uploaded in the Tablet.*

**C. Quality of TVET:** Important indicators affecting the quality of vocational training directly or indirectly have been discussed. More focus has been on the number of qualified and professional teachers, the existence of facilities and resources for practical exercises of students and the number of capacity building programs for teachers and admin staff.

One of the factors of low quality of teaching and is shortage of subject based professional teachers in the TVET institutions particularly in the districts and remote areas. It is quite difficult for TVET to relocate some subject based professional teachers from urban areas to needy institutions in distant areas. TVET program has no vision to develop relocation policy in future.

Out of 294 TVET institutions across the country, only around 20% of them have complete and semi-equipment and most of them are in the urban areas. Most of the schools that have no facilities and equipment for students' practicum, maintain their studies theoretically. Coordination between TVET and the government and non-government companies in paving the ways for practicum is weak. In fact TVET did not use the opportunity to strengthen coordination and communication with agencies in order to provide practicum for the students.

On the basis of teachers' qualification data from EMIS department, 66% of all TVET teachers have bachelor and upper qualifications, while 34% of them have lower than bachelor degrees. Low degree holder teachers are mostly recruited in the districts and remote areas where it is difficult to find qualified applicants for vocational trades. Also there is no specific capacity assessment plan designed and developed by TVET program in order to assess and identify existing capacity gaps among teachers in schools and conduct trainings.

**Recommendations #19:** *It is necessary to identify those TVET institutions having less or no equipments for practicum. These institutions should be prioritized in terms of mobilization. Also a coordination strategy should be developed with the participation of those development partners working towards mobilization of TVET institutions.*

*In order to improve professionalism among teachers, it is proposed that standard criteria set for recruitment process of new teachers should be seriously contemplated and implemented.*

*Before conducting of any training programs, a clear capacity assessment plan needs be developed and the teachers' capacity and training needs should be fully assessed. Trainings needs to be conducted based on assessment results in related vocational trades and subjects.*

**D. Equity in TVET:** The studies of ratios in TVET Program show the number of students' enrollment (male and female), the number of teachers and the level of achievements. By looking at the students' data in 2015, target has not been achieved successfully. In the TVET program, PTR for theory based studies is 25 while as regard to the importance of practicum the PTR is set 12 students per teacher during practicum. PTR indicator is quite high at the PED and DEO levels.

Still there are no TVET institutions in more than 200 districts while the demand for vocational studies is quite high not only among boys but also for girls.

**Recommendation #20:** *again refers to the process of recruiting teachers to balance PTR on the basis of norms. Therefore, schools needs to be identified and teachers should be recruited.*

*Also the number of TVET institutions should be expanded to all over Afghanistan in order to provide access to vocational education for all students. The other proposal for increasing access is that the provincial TVET institutes' intake system should be modified/rationalized to accommodate more rural students*

**E. Management in TVET:** During the review process it was found out that there is a big gap in terms of budget coordination between TVET and finance and accounting department. Finance and accounting department has a specific format and allocates a specific amount of budget for TVET considering expenditure from last year. In deed TVET operational plans prepared based on NESP is not coordinated and budgeted by finance and accounting department.

***Recommendation #21:*** *TVET program is responsible to consult with finance and accounting department in order to coordinate its budget plan and operational activities. Also TVET program has to justify the importance of budget operational plan activities for finance department in an explanatory way for convincing.*

## Chapter VI: Literacy Findings and Recommendation

Literacy and Adult Education is one of the important education programs in the Ministry of Education to reduce illiteracy in Afghanistan. Despite the vast implementation of the program throughout the country, a significant number of Afghanistan's population is still illiterate. Main findings of the current year review of Literacy Program are summarized as follows:

### **1. Literacy and Adult Education performance against plan**

Literacy program, on average, has achieved 63% of its targets in 2015/1394. The total budget of literacy program spent in 2014 was 591,972,024 Afs. Therefore, the program has spent 82.5% (68% development, 97% recurrent) of its budget. Also, the trend for the number of literacy learners has declined comparing to the previous year. Thus target for enrollment met only 67% of the target. We can dare say that the decrease in budget cannot be the reason for the decrease in the number of courses.

Table (6): Literacy achievements based on annual plan

No	Activities	2014	2015 Target	2015 Achievement	% of Progress
1	Number of Learners	537439	614,454	411843	67%
2	Number of Educators	8749	16122	10511	65%
3	Number of Literacy Courses	21785	29134	16166	56%

### **2. Review findings and recommendations**

**A: Relevance of Literacy Program:** Literacy has special curriculum but at the same time, it needs to be adjusted with the participants' interests, jobs, and characteristics of different groups. The literacy curriculum is not simple enough to transfer literacy skills to the literacy participants. Though training of vocation is included in the curriculum, in practice it is not observed; the main reason is lack of training facilities for practicum.

**Recommendation #22:** *Therefore, the review recommends that curriculum would be revised and adjusted with learners' needs, and jobs. Moreover, for training of vocation enough facilities would be facilitated.*

**B: Access to Literacy:** After 2012, enrollment rate in literacy courses has declined and in 2015 the total number was 411843, which was the lowest number in the last five years. It means that decrease in literacy budget in 2015 caused a remarkable decrease of enrollment rate.

**Recommendation #23:** *Increase of access to literacy needs more budgets, establishing of more literacy courses and recruitment of more educators. Most of literacy learners are women and residents of rural areas; therefore, facilitating their access to literacy program is necessary from equity perspective too.*

**C: Equity in Literacy Program:** In term of gender, access to literacy had been equally distributed among men and women, the women literacy participants were even more than men participants. But in 2015 we witnessed the decline in women literacy learners; in this year, the enrollment ratio of male and female in literacy was just the opposite in 2014, that is to say, along with general decline in the number of literacy learners in this year, female literacy learners had the maximum decline. In term of geographical balance, the rural areas have problems in access to literacy, due to scattered villages and their distances from each other, holding literacy courses that all villagers can have access to them is not possible, as a result, considerable portion of the villagers don't have access to literacy programs.

**Recommendation #24:** *Constructive interaction with mosques and mullahs, as a popular institutes and activists, can help MoE to expand literacy services to rural areas; mosques and mullahs are the most trusted entities in rural community, using them as literacy provider opens a new window for service delivery in literacy sector.*

**D: Quality in Literacy Program:** The number of literacy educators in 2015 has declined comparing to 2014; the total number of literacy educators has declined from 10511 in 2014 to 8749 in 2015; it means that 1762 literacy educators are cut down; considering the decline of literacy learners in the mentioned year, decline of educators was not unexpected, it is usual, that whenever the number of literacy applicants decreases, the number of educators also declines. In addition, completion rate in literacy courses are relatively low. Moreover, literacy educators are not included in adult education training.

**Recommendation #25:** *To improve access to and quality of literacy program, MoE needs more educators and courses. Training of vocations in literacy courses, as incentive for learners, can encourage learners to complete the program and increase completion rate. Establishing a department of adult education for capacity building of literacy educators and developing an assessment system to evaluate literacy achievements are necessary steps in improving the quality of literacy program.*

## **Final Remarks (way forward)**

Review finding in the backdrop of field visits, statistical analysis and discussions with key informants depicts that MoE achieved most of its annual targets for operational plan 2015. However, MoE budget execution rates for ordinary budget line is 99% and for development budget line is 31% in 2015.

### **The main achievements of MoE can be accounted for as:**

- Students' enrollment in all programs except TVET has slightly increased in 2015.
- Textbooks and other teaching and learning materials were distributed for students of primary level.
- Although a number of new educational center were established, the number is slightly less than previous year.

### **However, MoE is still faced with a number of challenges that require scrupulous attention from MoE and its development partners:**

- A huge proportion of school-age children still do not have access to educational centers. MoE does not know the exact number, location and reasons of these out-of-school children.
- There have been dispersed efforts to conduct assessment of students' learning achievement MoE, however, still needs to have unified learning assessment system for different MoE programs.
- Lack of qualified teacher is observed in all MoE programs, particularly in General Education which constitutes the biggest number of school age population in Afghanistan. Lack of female teacher in general and qualified female teacher in particular needs serious attention.
- The relevance and quality of curriculum is still a challenge mainly in General and Islamic Education as well as Literacy.

***The Review has come up with 25 substantial recommendations that are listed in the previous sections which merit undivided attention to be prioritized and put in realistic action-plan for next years.***

***In order to materialize recommendations of the review a consultative process is required to prepare an action matrix (aide memoire) for each of the program recommendations. MoE programs should implement the devised action matrix thereupon.***